



Board of Trustees Regular Meeting
MINUTES (approved)
Thursday, March 20, 2025 at 4:00pm
McGuire Community Room
610 Woodmere Ave., MI 49686

1. **Call to Order**

The meeting was called to order by Vice President Deyo at 4:00pm. Present were: Deyo (Vice President); Odgers (Treasurer); Vickery, Jones, and Beuthin (Trustees). Pakieser (President) and Gedman (Secretary) were absent. Also present were: Howard (Director); Seuryneck (Counsel via Zoom), Baldwin, and Carpenter (Staff).

2. **Pledge of Allegiance**

All members in attendance recited the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America.

3. **Approval of the Agenda**

Vice President Deyo noted an amendment to the agenda to add New Business, item c, Board response letter to Legislators regarding the executive order to eliminate the Institute for Museum and Library Services (IMLS). It was MOVED by Odgers, SUPPORTED by Jones, to approve the amended agenda. Motion CARRIED.

Vickery volunteered to fill in as Acting Secretary for the meeting due to Secretary Gedman's absence. Vice President Deyo then assigned Vickery the duties of Secretary for the meeting.

4. **Public Comment**

Vice President Deyo opened the floor for public comment. The following people addressed the board regarding the Requests for Reconsideration next on the agenda: Request for Consideration Appellant explained their concerns regarding *Grandad's Pride* and posed some questions to the board; Andy Schuck, TADL Youth Services Department Head; Amy Monette, Kingsley Branch Manager; Cindy Shaprio, Thompsonville; Sue Bower; Jodi Simpson; B. Murphy, Dr. Dave Botville; Margaret Goeman representative from League of Women Voters Grand Traverse; Ellen Baird, Elk Rapids; Kate Husband, Elk Rapids; Sue Jennings, Lake Ann; Sarah Redman, retired librarian; Reverend Jim Perra, Grace Episcopal Church, Traverse City; Roberta Wasolewski, Williamsburg; Melissa Hefner; Mike Naughton, ACLU Chairman; Abigail Frist, Traverse City; Abby Cherry; Dr. Kathleen Norman, Acme; Sherry Wilson, Garfield; Amy Hartsaw, Long Lake; Joelle Hannert, Tech Services at NMC; Ross Hammerslee, Traverse City; Kelly Taylor, Traverse City; Peter Bornwolf, Traverse City; John Ellenger; Iris Johnson, Traverse City; Susam Lamoie, Traverse City; Raven; Lindsay Bolser, Traverse Area Kinksters Group; Jason; Katie Larion, Union Township.

5. **Request for Reconsideration**

a. *Introduction*

Howard noted that the basis for the request for reconsideration was an objectionable picture in the book *Grandad's Pride* by Harry Woodgate and a request to put the book behind the Youth Services desk rather than on the open shelves. Howard emphasized the library's obligation to uphold the First Amendment and the library's policies. A team of herself, Youth Services Coordinator Andy Schuck, and Adult Services Coordinator Melissa McKenna read the book and looked at the book's illustrations, reviewed it against TADL policies and the First Amendment, which resulted in a denial of the request.

(approved)

Page 1 of 8

An email response was sent to the complainant and then Howard received a response asking to appeal the decision to the board of trustees.

b. *Acknowledgement of Correspondence Received*

In addition to those who spoke in public comment, the board had received over 100 comments via email and letter format regarding the request for reconsideration appeal.

c. *Discussion, with possible Closed Session to discuss material subject to the attorney-client privilege exempt by statute pursuant to Section 13(1)(g) of the Michigan Freedom of Information Act. MCL 15.243(1)(g).*

It was MOVED by Odgers SUPPORTED by Jones, to go into closed session to discuss material subject to attorney-client privilege exempt by statute pursuant to Section 13(1)(g) of the Michigan Freedom of Information Act. MCL 15.243(1)(g). A roll call vote was taken with the following results:

Odgers – aye	Vickery – aye	Deyo – aye	Jones - aye
Beuthin – aye	Pakieser – absent	Gedman – absent	

Motion CARRIED with 5 aye, 2 absent, meeting the requirements of the Open Meetings Act for closed session.

Vice President Deyo dismissed the trustees to the Youth Services story room at 5:24pm to go into closed session.

The trustees returned to the McGuire Community Room at 6:20pm and it was MOVED by Odgers, SUPPORTED by Jones, to resume open session. Motion CARRIED.

Vice President Deyo asked Seurnyck (Counsel) to explain some of the issues regarding the request for reconsideration appeal. Seurnyck then reviewed the rules, regulations, and law that must be followed to remove or move a book from the library.

d. *Board Decision Regarding Request for Reconsideration*

Following Counsel’s statements, it was MOVED by Beuthin, SUPPORTED by Jones, to adopt the Resolution to Deny Appeal of Reconsideration Request Regarding Grandad’s Pride. The resolution to deny the appeal, as written by Counsel, is as follows:

TRAVERSE AREA DISTRICT LIBRARY
 RESOLUTION TO DENY APPEAL OF RECONSIDERATION REQUEST
 REGARDING *GRANDAD’S PRIDE*

At a meeting of the Library Board of the Traverse Area Public Library held in the Main Library, 610 Woodmere Ave, Traverse City, MI 49686, on March 20, 2025, at 4:00 p.m., Eastern Daylight Time.

PRESENT: Members _____

ABSENT: Members _____

The following resolution was offered by Member _____ and supported by Member _____:

WHEREAS, the Traverse Area District Library was established under the provisions of the District Library Establishment Act, 1989 PA 24 (“DLEA”); and

WHEREAS, pursuant to the DLEA, the Board is authorized to enact policies governing the use of the Library, and has adopted a Collections Materials Selection Policy (“Policy”);

WHEREAS, pursuant to terms of the Policy, a Request for Reconsideration was filed for *Grandad’s Pride* by Harry Woodgate;

WHEREAS, the basis for the request is stated more fully in the attached request for reconsideration;

WHEREAS, pursuant to the Policy, an appeal was filed with the Traverse Area Public Library Board (“Library Board”).

WHEREAS, the Library Board met on March 20, 2025, to consider the appeal.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED AS FOLLOWS: the Library Board of Traverse Area District Library has determined it is in the best interest of the Library to deny the appeal to secure *Grandad’s Pride* (“Book”) in a “request only” area for the following reasons:

1. Under the United States Constitution, a decision to remove or restrict access to a book impacts the First Amendment Rights of patrons who will no longer have access to the Book at the Library or will have burdens placed on their access to the Book at the Library. Such a decision similarly infringes on patron rights under Article 1, Section 5 of Michigan’s Constitution of 1963.
2. This request for reconsideration asks for the Library Board to censor information that would otherwise be available to other patrons because of the content and subject matter of the Book.
3. The First Amendment right to receive information cannot be denied to other patrons because people may dislike the ideas, content, and subject matter contained in the Book.
4. The Book does not violate Michigan or federal law, so patrons who desire to read the book are entitled to protection against censorship under the law.
5. In addition to following federal and state laws, the Library has enacted the Policy to assist the Library with its mission of education and with protecting the First Amendment Rights of its patrons.
6. Based on the United States and Michigan Constitutions, federal and Michigan law, and the Policy, the Library Board selection and retention of *Grandad’s Pride* in the children’s nonfiction section is consistent with Library Policy for the following reasons:

- A. The Library is not in violation of federal or state law by maintaining a copy of the Book in the Library. In fact, the Library is upholding a fundamental right guaranteed by the United States and Michigan Constitutions.
- B. Under the Policy, materials will be selected based on positive reviews in professional journals or actual examination and evaluation of materials. In addition, popular demand (bestsellers, school bibliographies, local interest) may be used as criterion for selection of materials. Items that must be updated every year may be placed on a standing order list to ensure timely delivery. Suggestions from the community for items to be considered for purchase are strongly encouraged, but materials must meet selection criteria.
- C. The Library has determined there are no compelling governmental interests in this instance that would allow it to restrict access to the Book or censor the Book on the basis of its content or the fact that some people disagree with the message or feel uncomfortable with any one part of the material.
- D. The Book is catalogued and maintained in the children's nonfiction section. As with any content, parents or legal guardians should be responsible for the selection of materials, and the Library cannot restrict material because one person may find it objectionable or that children can access the Book if their parents chose not to accompany them to the Library. This denies the rights of parents to select the Book for their child.
- E. The Book meets the Selection Criteria and other standards of the Policy to remain in the children's section:
- 1) There is contemporary significance and interest in checking out this material.
 - 2) Including the Book within the collection is consistent with the goal of material selection to provide a well-balanced and broad collection of materials and meets the Selection Criteria to show different points of view.
 - 3) For this Book, the author has received the following awards:
 - Lambda Literary Award Finalist, 2024
 - Rainbow List: Top Ten LGBTQ Books for Children and Teens: Commended, 2024.
 - Recent Book Award Finalist, 2024
 - 2024 Indie Book Awards Shortlist
 - 2024 Diverse Book Awards Shortlist

- Gerontological Society of America’s Book Award for Best Children’s Literature on Aging

4) The Book has received positive reviews, including the following in full or in part:

“The sequel to the Waterstones Children’s Book Prize winning Grandad’s Camper is full of verve and beautiful illustration from author-illustrator Harry Woodgate, with a simple but meaningful story about the history of Pride, and the importance of supporting inclusive communities.”

-BookTrust

“Readers familiar with Milly and Grandad will welcome this sophomore outing, and the book will be in especially heavy rotation in libraries during Pride Month. Woodgate’s upbeat art brims with color and, aptly, rainbow motifs, depicting a supportive community diverse in race, ability, and self-expression. This is a quiet yet moving read with a powerful message: You don’t need corporate sponsorship or larger-than-life events to celebrate Pride; all you need is love. A winner from beginning to end—and affirmation that Pride belongs in every community.”

-Kirkus Reviews

“The adorable and uplifting sequel to Waterstones Children's Book Prize category winner Grandad's Camper sees Milly attempt to bring the spirit of Pride to her beloved grandfather's cottage.”

-Waterstones

“Bustling, bright-hued images with a rainbow motif show the intersectionally diverse community-portraying people of varying abilities, body types, gender expressions, and skin tones-preparing for the event, giving each page a celebratory vibe. In this gladly intergenerational view of Pride, Woodgate's sequel to Grandad's Camper offers a familial portrait that twines past and present”.

-Publishers Weekly

“The book reflects on an aspect of mature gay life, a piercing sense of loss, and in the child, of the possibilities still to be found. For the hope for new adventures, and the glimpse of intergenerational kindness and understanding, this lovely book should be on every shelf.”

- School Library Journal

5) The current location of the book in the children’s nonfiction section is appropriate. Amazon is a place that the public frequently visits to 3.7./5 stars and recommends it for readers ages 3 and up. According to all professional reviews and the publisher’s information, this book is aimed at children ages 3 to 6. This places this book solidly in the children’s nonfiction collection. In looking at the Michigan eLibrary, a statewide library catalog that most of the public libraries in the state participate in, as well as some school and academic libraries, at least 50 copies of this book are located in children’s collections across the state.

F. In contrast, a request to sequester the Book would violate the “Labeling” Section of the Policy, which specifically states that “[t]he library collection will be organized, cataloged, and marked for the primary purpose of helping people find the materials they want. The library does not label, alter, or shield materials due to the nature of the content or imagery. The library does not add or remove evaluative labels from library materials, such as MPAA ratings on some motion pictures, or language ratings on some audio materials.”

7. All resolutions in conflict with this Resolution are repealed.

YEAS: _____

NAYS: _____

Resolution declared _____

STATE OF MICHIGAN)
)
COUNTY OF GRAND TRAVERSE)

I, the undersigned, the duly qualified and acting Secretary of the Traverse Area District Library, Grand Traverse County, Michigan, DO HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing is a true and complete copy of certain proceedings taken by the Library Board at a regular meeting held on March 20, 2025 at 4:00 p.m.

Secretary

A roll call vote was taken with the following results:

Odgers – aye	Vickery – aye	Deyo – aye	Jones - aye
Beuthin – aye	Pakieser – absent	Gedman – absent	

Motion CARRIED, with 5 ayes, 2 absent.

6. Consent Calendar

- e. *Approval of Minutes - Regular Meeting of February 20, 2025*
- f. *Department Reports*
- g. *Finance and Facilities Committee Report – March 4, 2025*
- h. *Policy and Personnel Committee Report – did not meet*
- i. *Financial Report*
- j. *Member Library Communications – FLPL | IPL | PCL*
- k. *Friends of TADL Report – Jud Barclay, President*
- l. *Correspondence*

It was MOVED by Odgers, SUPPORTED by Beuthin, to accept and affirm receipt of the consent calendar information as presented. Motion CARRIED.

7. Items Removed from the Consent Calendar

No items were removed from the consent calendar.

8. Director Report

Howard confirmed her written report and thanked those who attended the meeting and spoke in support of the library staff, and those who love the library and the community we live in.

9. Old Business

a. *Employee Handbook Revisions*

It was MOVED by Jones, SUPPORTED by Vickery, to accept the changes to the TADL Employee Handbook as presented. Howard verified that Lindsay Raymond, TADL’s legal counsel for employment matters, reviewed the changes and they satisfy the Earned Sick Time Act recently approved by the Michigan legislature discussed at the previous board meeting. A roll call vote was taken with the following results:

Odgers – aye	Vickery – aye	Deyo – aye	Jones - aye
Beuthin – aye	Pakieser – absent	Gedman – absent	

Motion CARRIED, with 5 ayes and 2 absent.

b. *Amendment to Teamsters Collective Bargaining Agreement*

It was MOVED by Jones, SUPPORTED by Odgers to accept the agreement between TADL and the Teamsters Local 214 as presented regarding the Earned Sick Time Act referenced in item 9a. Howard verified that TADL had discussed the changes with the Teamsters and all supported the agreement. A roll call vote was taken with the following results:

Odgers – aye	Vickery – aye	Deyo – aye	Jones - aye
Beuthin – aye	Pakieser – absent	Gedman – absent	

Motion CARRIED with 5 ayes and 2 absent.

c. *Kingsley Branch Library Closure March 23 – April 4 for Carpet Installation*

It was MOVED by Odgers SUPPORTED by Jones, to close the Kingsley Branch Library from March 23 through April 4, 2025 for the purpose of new carpet installation and remodeling. Motion CARRIED.

10. New Business

a. *Approval to Pay Snow Plowing Invoice*

It was MOVED by Odgers, SUPPORTED by Jones, to allow the Director to exceed her \$25,000 spending limit in order to pay invoices from One Call for snow and lawn services for the remainder of 2025. A roll call vote was taken with the following results:

Odgers – aye	Vickery – aye	Deyo – aye	Jones - aye
Beuthin – aye	Pakieser – absent	Gedman – absent	

Motion CARRIED with 5 ayes, 2 absent.

b. *Approval to Purchase New Security Gates*

It was MOVED by Odgers, SUPPORTED by Jones to approve the purchase of new security gates at the Main Library with funds from the Public Improvement Fund for the not to exceed amount of \$29,000 as presented. A roll call vote was taken with the following results:

Odgers – aye	Vickery – aye	Deyo – aye	Jones - aye
Beuthin – aye	Pakieser – absent	Gedman – absent	

Motion CARRIED with 5 ayes, 2 absent.

c. *Board Response Letter RE: Executive Order to Eliminate the Institute for Museum and Library Services (IMLS)*

It was MOVED by Beuthin, SUPPORTED by Jones, to authorize the Director to send a letter to our elected officials urging them to support libraries by fully finding and supporting the Institute for Museum and Library Services (IMLS) as presented. Motion CARRIED.

Vice President Deyo encouraged trustees and community members to follow suit in support for the IMLS as it funds many things, and in particular MelCat, an interlibrary loan service which so many of TADL's patrons use.

11. **Public Comment**

Vice President Deyo opened the floor for public comment. The following people addressed the board: Cindy Shapiro, Thomsonville; Amy Monette, Kingsley Branch Library (KBL) Manager thanked the board for approving the closure at KBL for the new carpet installation and re-organization of the shelving layout; Kim Wiggins, introduced herself as TADL's union steward and thanked the board for approving the Letter of Understanding presented to them.

12. **Trustee Comment**

Vice President Deyo noted that beyond requests for removal of books from shelves, patrons also have an equally valid opportunity to request books to be added to the shelves.

13. **Closed Session (if needed)**

A closed session was not needed.

14. **Adjournment**

With a motion to adjourn by Odgers, supported by Jones, Vice President Deyo adjourned the meeting at 6:53pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Approved by board vote on April 17, 2025

V. Carpenter, Recording Secretary

S. Gedman, Board Secretary